The Director General,
Technical Education Department,
Bays No. 7-12, Sec-4, Panchkula, Haryana.

2. Dr. D.C. Bhatt, GJUS&T, Hisar.
3. Dr. A.B. Gupta, NITTTR, Chandigarh.

Memo No.: EC/Colleges/2018/1924-1926
Dated: 16/07/18

Subject: Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Equivalency Committee held under the Chairmanship of Dr. R.S. Dhillon, IAS, DGTE on 20.07.2018 at 11:30 AM in the Conference Room of DGTE, Panchkula.

Kindly refer to the subject noted above.

2. In this connection, the copy of approved minutes of the meeting of Equivalency Committee held under the Chairmanship of Dr. R.S. Dhillon, IAS, DGTE on 20.07.2018 at 11:30 AM in the Conference Room of Directorate of Technical Education, Panchkula is hereby enclosed for information and comments if any, withing 07 (Seven) days. The minutes will be stand confirmed in the absence of any comments.

Joint Director (Colleges/Univ.)
-cum-Member Secretary (Equiv. Committee)
For Director General Technical Education
Panchkula, Haryana
Dated: 16/07/18

Endst No.: EC/Colleges/2018/1927

A copy of the approved minutes is forwarded to the following for information, necessary action and further communication to the concerned quarters for their respective the agenda items to whom it pertains:

1. Joint Director (University/Colleges), DTE office.
2. Controller of Administration & Finance, HSBTE, Panchkula.

Joint Director (Colleges/Univ.)
-cum-Member Secretary (Equiv. Committee)
For Director General Technical Education
Panchkula, Haryana
Dated: 16/07/18

Endst No.: EC/Colleges/2018/1929

A copy of the above is the forwarded to the following for information and necessary action please:

1. PS to DGTE for kind information of DGTE please.
2. PA to DTE-cum-Secretary, HSBTE for kind information of DTE-cum-Secretary, HSBTE please.
3. Sh. P.K. Malhotra, Joint Director, HSTES, Panchkula
4. Sh. Rajbir Singh, ADA, DTE
5. Dr. Sultan Singh, COAI, HSBTE
6. Sh. R.K. Miglani, JS, HSBTE- Invitee
7. Dr. Nitdi Aggarwal, Asst. Secy, HSBTE- Invitee
8. Sh. Arun Kumar, DD (Univ)- Invitee
9. DD (IT) to host the above letter alongwith approved minutes on the web site of the Department.

Joint Director (Colleges/Univ.)
-cum-Member Secretary (Equiv. Committee)
For Director General Technical Education
Panchkula, Haryana.
**Subject:** Minutes of the meeting of Equivalency Committee held under the Chairmanship of Dr. R.S. Dhillon, IAS, DGTE on 20.07.2018 at 12.30 Noon in the Conference Room of Directorate of Technical Education, Haryana Panchkula.

The meeting under the Chairmanship of W/DGTE was held on 20.07.2018 at 12.30 Noon. The following were present in the meeting:

1. Sh. K.K. Kataria, DTE.
2. Sh. S.K. Aggarwal, YMCAUS&T, Faridabad
3. Dr. D.C. Bhatt, GJUS&T, Hisar
4. Dr. A.B. Gupta, NITTTR, Chandigarh
5. Sh. Rajinder Kumar Choudhary, JD (College/Univ.)
6. Sh. P.K. Malhotra, Joint Director, DTE, Panchkula
7. Sh. Rajbir Singh, ADA, DTE
8. Dr. Sultan Singh, COAF, HSBTE
9. Sh. R.K. Miglani, JS, HSBTE- Invitee
10. Dr. Nidhi Aggarwal, Asstt. Secy, HSBTE- Invitee
11. Sh. Arun Kumar, DD (Univ.)- Invitee

The agenda items pertaining to Diploma Technical Courses and Degree Technical Courses submitted by HSBTE and University Branch of DTE vide their U.O. No. 169/Equi./HSBTE dated 05.06.2018 and U.O. No. 143/Univ. dated 17.07.2018 respectively were placed in the meeting. The Agenda items were deliberated one by one and following decisions were taken by the committee:

A) Agenda items submitted by HSBTE pertaining to Diploma Technical Courses:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Agenda Brief</th>
<th>Recommendations of HSBTE</th>
<th>Decision of the equivalency committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Recognition / approval and mode of diploma (Plant &amp; Maintenance Engg.) awarded by SLIET, Longowal Punjab [Case of Sh. Vinod Kumar submitted by PWD (B&amp;R)]</td>
<td>✔ 1. Clarification to be sought from PSBTE whether the diploma awarded by SLIET Longowal for the academic session 2004-05 is approved / recognized by the Punjab State Board or not. 2. Clarification from AICTE to be sought regarding the list of approved diploma courses in respect of SLIET, Longowal for the academic session 2004-05.</td>
<td>The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However the committee members were of the view that matter is pending since for a long time and HSBTE should obtain the information expeditiously from PSBTE and AICTE i.e. upto 15.08.2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Diploma in Electrical Engg. From AOCAFRO, New Delhi [Case of Sh. Amar Singh submitted by PWD (B&amp;R)]</td>
<td>The matter be deferred till the receipt of clarification for AFRO, New Delhi (keeping in view the information submitted by the PWD (B&amp;R) on 21.03.2018)</td>
<td>The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However HSBTE will write a detailed letter to AFRO, New Delhi for providing the desired information, so as to decide the matter timely.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Diploma in Radio Fitter recognized as diploma in electronics by GoI [Case of Sh. Karnail Singh, GSA (ESM) submitted by HVPNL, Panchkula]</td>
<td>✔ 1. The matter to be pursued with AICTE regarding the approval of institute, mode &amp; duration of diploma course. 2. HVPNL to be requested to submit the complete set of DMC's and Diploma certificate of Sh. Karnail Singh reflecting the complete duration of diploma course from Indian Air Force.</td>
<td>The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However HSBTE should obtain the information expeditiously from AICTE and HVPNL i.e. up to 15.08.2018.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.) Diploma from Naval Institute of Aeronautical Technology, Kochi
[Case of Sh. Jogender Singh submitted by PWD (B&R)]

1. The matter to be pursued with AICTE regarding the mode & duration of diploma course offered by the said institute.

2. PWD (B&R) to be requested to submit the complete set of DMC’s and Diploma certificate of Sh. Jogender Singh reflecting the complete duration of diploma course from Naval Institute of Aeronautical Technology, Kochi.

3. Equivalency of Mechatronics Engineering with Mechanical Engineering or Electronics & Communication Engineering

The expert committee has recommended that a major portion of the curriculum of Mechanical Engg. and Electronics & Comm. Engg. is not covered under Mechatronics Engg. Moreover, the competency profile of diploma holder in Mechatronics Engg. covers only the basic concepts of Mechanical Engg. and Electronics & Comm. Engg. hence, the competency level of diploma holder in Mechatronics Engg. is not at par with competency level of Mechanical Engg. and Electronics & Comm. Engg. Therefore, diploma course in Mechatronics Engg. is not equivalent to diploma in Mechanical Engineering or Electronics & Communication Engineering.

4. Recognition / Equivalency of ICE / IME (Distance Mode Education)
[Clarification sought by Public Health Engineering Deptt. regarding ICE]
[Clarification Sought by Dy. Registrar of Bimla Devi Group of Institutions regarding IME]

The departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the Board does not recognize the diploma qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

The recommendations of HSBTE approved. It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the Board does not recognize the diploma qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

5. Recognition / equivalency of diploma certificate issued by IETE, New Delhi
[Case of Sh. Jasvinder Singh, GSO submitted by HVPN, Panchkula]

The Draftsman Civil is a trade certificate of 2 years duration awarded under the aegis of The recommendations of HSBTE approved. It was decided that the department concerned be intimated that
[Case of Sh. Ghanshyam working as Boiler / Bagaase Cooie submitted by Kaithal Co-operative Sugar Mills Limited, Haryana]

The one year certificate course in Electrician does not fall in the purview of Haryana State Board of Technical Education. Therefore, the approval / recognition status may be got clarified from Skill Development & Industrial Training Department, Haryana.

8. Recognition of diploma in Electrical Engineering from Assam University, Silchar
[Case of Sh. Rajesh, GSA submitted by HVPN, Panchkula]

The Board recognizes AICTE approved 3 years regular diploma courses awarded by the concerned State Board of Technical Education. Therefore, clarification to be sought from Directorate of Technical Education, Assam regarding the approval and recognition of the diploma courses offered by the Assam University.

9. Diploma in Civil Engg. from CMJ University, Meghalaya
[Case of Sh. Jitender Singh submitted by PWD (B&R)]

In view of the dispute regarding degrees awarded by CMJ University, Meghalaya, the Board did not consider the diploma awarded by CMJ University, Meghalaya.

10. Regarding verification of diploma awarded by 2 Signal Training Centre, Goa
[Case of Sh. Dharmender submitted by PWD (B&R)]

1. The matter to be pursued with AICTE regarding the mode & duration of diploma course offered by the said institute.
2. Clarification regarding the recognition of diploma courses may be sought from

The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However HSBTE shall seek clarification from Directorate of Technical Education, Assam upto 15.08.2018.

The recommendations of HSBTE approved. The concerned department be informed that the one year certificate course in Electrician does not fall in the purview of Haryana State Board of Technical Education. Therefore, the approval / recognition status may be got clarified from Skill Development & Industrial Training Department, Haryana.

The Draftsman Civil is a trade certificate of 2 years duration awarded under the aegis of Skill Development & Industrial Training Department, Haryana. The 3 years Diploma in Civil Engg. awarded by the Haryana State Board of Technical Education under the aegis of Department of Technical Education, Haryana, is a higher qualification in the same line as covered under Chief Secretary, Haryana Notification No. 10/4/2015-3GSIII dated 25.03.2016. Further the concerned department may take necessary action at their end.

The recommendations of HSBTE approved. Accordingly, in view of the dispute regarding degrees awarded by CMJ University, Meghalaya, it was decided that diploma in Civil Engg. awarded by CMJ University, Meghalaya cannot be considered.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Equivalency of the diploma in Tool &amp; Die offered by Nettur Technical Training Foundation (NTTF), Hyderabad</td>
<td>In view of the recognition of diploma awarded by NTTF by the Govt. of India, Orissa, Kerala &amp; other Universities, it was decided to take up the agenda item in the next meeting of the Board of HSBTE for deliberation and decision and in the meanwhile clarification may also be sought from NTTF.</td>
<td>The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However, HSBTE will refer the remaining matters to the expert committee(s) and will obtain the observations of the committee(s) up to 31.08.2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Equivalency of diploma in Electronics &amp; Communication Engineering to Electronics Engineering / Electronics and Instrumentation / Instrumentation &amp; Control Engineering</td>
<td>In the meeting of equivalency committee held on 09.04.2013, the Board has already decided the equivalency of Electronics Engineering to Electronics &amp; Communication Engineering. The remaining matters may be referred to the expert committee(s).</td>
<td>The recommendations of HSBTE approved. However, HSBTE will obtain the desired information/clarification from all concerned upto 15.08.2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 13     | Review of recognition of diploma awarded by Indian Air Force [Case of Sh. Roshan Lal submitted by HVPNL, Panchkula] | 1. The matter to be pursued with AICTE regarding the approval of institute, mode & duration of diploma course.  
2. HVPNL be requested to submit the complete set of DMC's and Diploma certificate of Sh. Roshan Lal reflecting the complete duration of diploma course from Indian Army (Corps. of Signals) Jabalpur. | The recommendations of HSBTE approved. HSBTE will inform to the applicant that the notification in this regard issued by the State Government and available at hsbye.org.in, is self-explanatory. |
| 14     | Clarification whether diploma course is equivalent to 10+2 with science subjects | The notification in this regard issued by the State Government and available at hsbye.org.in, is self-explanatory. | The recommendations of HSBTE approved. HSBTE will inform to the applicant that the notification in this regard issued by the State Government and available at hsbye.org.in, is self-explanatory. |
| 15     | Recognition of Diploma in Civil Engineering [DCLE (G)] awarded by IGNOU | The Board recognizes AICTE approved 3 years regular diploma courses awarded by the concerned State Board of Technical Education. Further, as per AICTE letter dated 02.11.2011, the Council | The recommendations of HSBTE approved. The applicant be inform that the HSBTE recognizes AICTE approved 3 years regular diploma courses awarded by the concerned State Board of |
does not recognize the qualifications acquired through distance education mode. Moreover, in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the Board does not recognize the diploma qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

### Supplementary Agenda (on table)

| 16 | It was deliberated that the other Departments are referring a lot of cases to the Board seeking/asking:

1. The verification of the qualification(s) possessed by the candidate(s)

2. Whether the qualification possessed by the candidate is valid/applicable for the purpose of recruitment/promotion in their respective Departments?

|   | It was decided that the Board may notify the essential conditions/parameters regarding the recognition of a diploma qualification.

- Further, reiterating the CS Haryana Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, it may also be notified that Technical Education Department, Panchkula pertains only to equivalency and recognition, for which the other Departments may refer the complete cases accordingly.

- The verification of any diploma qualification may be sought from the issuing authority.

- The suitability of any diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment/promotion may be decided by the concerned department as per their service rules.

|   | The recommendations of HSBTE approved. Further it was decided that:

1. As per the CS Haryana Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the Technical Education Department, Panchkula has been notified the Nodal department to give advice on the issues relating to equivalency aspects of qualifications, recognition of degree/diploma qualifications and recognition of universities/institutions in various discipline covered by Technical Education. In order to streamline the process of the cases received from other State Govt. departments, HSBTE will decide the essential conditions/parameters, which are required to evaluate the Proposal/request of the other department in connection with the equivalency and recognition of the qualifications. Thereafter the same will be notified by the department to other State Govt. departments, Board, Corporations etc. for sending the request.
B) Agenda items submitted by University Branch pertaining to Degree Technical Courses:

University branch submitted the agenda but without any recommendations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Agenda</th>
<th>Decision of the Equivalency Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Confirmation of Minutes of Equivalency Committee meeting Held on 13.12.2017 at 12.00 Noon under the Chairmanship of W/DGTE.</td>
<td>The minutes of the meeting of the Equivalence Committee held on 13.12.2017 at 12.00 noon held under the Chairman Ship of W/DGTE pertaining to Agendas of HSBTE (Diploma Technical Courses) and of University branch pertaining to Degree Technical Courses were confirmed. However, in the next meeting of Equivalency Committee both HSBTE and University branch will put up the agenda items pertaining to action taken report of the Equivalency Committee meeting held on 13.12.2017 alongwith the action taken report of the present meeting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Clarification regarding B.Tech. in Electrical Engineering- Sh. Dinesh, J.E-I.</td>
<td>The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the suitability of any degree/ diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment /employment and promotion shall be decided by the concerned department being employer, as per the provisions of their service rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Clarification in respect of validity of AMIETE (Graduate Ship acquired in the year 2005 from the Institution Electronics Communication Engg.)</td>
<td>It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Recognition of degree acquired from Vinayaka Mission University, University, Salem (Tamil Nadu).</td>
<td>The matter was deliberated and it was decided that as per the reply given by AICTE vide its letter F. No. AICTE/P&amp;AP/MHRD/Misc/2018 dated 12.03.2018. The concerned department i.e. HVPN Ltd. Panchkula be intimated that degree in Engineering awarded by Vinayaka Mission University, Salem through Distance Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5 Regarding recognition of University and Equivalency of degree in Bachelor of Library & Information Science through Distance Education mode from Sam Higinbottom University of Agriculture, Technology and Sciences, Allahabad.

As per the CS Haryana Notification No. 42/178/2009-SGSI dated 21.05.2009, the Technical Education Department, Panchkula has been notified the Model department to give advice on the issues relating to Equivalency aspects of qualifications, recognition of degree/diploma qualifications and recognition of Universities/ Institutions in various discipline covered by Technical Education. The discipline of ‘Library and Information Science’ is not under the purview of the Technical Education as such no action is required to be taken by the Equivalency Committee. Hence, the concerned department should seek clarification from the appropriate authority.

6 Regarding validity of Institution’s Associate Membership Examination from Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Mumbai.

It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-SGSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-SGSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

7 Regarding Degree Qualification from IME Mumbai in the light of judgment of Hon’ble Supreme Court in SLP (c) 35793-35796 of 2012 CA No. 17902-17905 of 2017.

It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-SGSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-SGSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

8 Regarding Harassment of Engineers in Govt. job having qualification AMIE from institution of Engineers (India) in promotions and recruitments.

It was deliberated and decided that it is upto the employer to consider the qualification of AMIE (Section A & B examination) for promotion to the post if the said qualification is mentioned in the service rules of the concerned department. The judgment dated 06.11.2012 of Hon’ble High court, Chandigarh passed in the Kartar Singh Vs Union of India & others (CWP No. 1640 of 2008) and the judgment dated 03.11.2017 of Apex Court in CIVIL APPEAL NOS. 17869-17870/2017 may be referred.

9 Regarding validity of Degree/reorganization of IMEI, Mumbai

It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-SGSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-SGSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.

10 Verification and Validity of Certificate issued by Institution of Mechanical Engineer India Bombay (IMEI) in the 2003.

It was decided that the departments concerned be intimated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-SGSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-SGSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Clarification/Relevant Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Regarding Equivalency of Technical Qualification awarded by Deemed University and distance mode for the purpose of requirement and promotion in Haryana Govt. The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the matter is pertaining to the Grievance of the employees and the action is to be taken by the respective employer as per the prevailing rules and court directions. Hence, it was decided that concerned employer should approach to their appropriate authority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Clarification Regarding Educational Qualification recruitment to the post of Assistant Executive Engineer (Civil &amp; Mechanical) Class-I in Public Health Engineering Department, Haryana. The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the suitability of any degree/ diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment /employment and promotion shall be decided by the concerned department being employer, as per the provisions of their service rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Regarding Equivalency of Degree. The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the suitability of any degree/ diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment /employment and promotion shall be decided by the concerned department being employer, as per the provisions of their service rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Estt. Junior Engineer regarding validity of AMIE degree issued by Institute of Engg., Kolkata. The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the suitability of any degree/ diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment /employment and promotion shall be decided by the concerned department being employer, as per the provisions of their service rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Recruitment to the post of Geophysicist in Public Health Engg. Department. The matter was deliberated and it was decided that the suitability of any degree/ diploma qualification for the purpose of recruitment /employment and promotion shall be decided by the concerned department being employer, as per the provisions of their service rules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Clarification of Validity of AMIE qualification obtained from Institutions of Engineers, Kolkata and degree acquired from IME, Mumbai for the purpose of direct recruitment and for the purpose of promotion to the post of Assistant Engineer/Electrical in HVPL. It was deliberated and decided that it is upto the-employer to consider the qualification of AMIE (Section A &amp; B examination) for promotion to the post if the said qualification is mentioned in the service rules of the concerned department. The judgment dated 06.11.2012 of Hon’ble High court, Chandigarh passed in the Kartar Singh Vs Union of India &amp; others (CWP No. 1640 of 2008) and the judgment dated 03.11.2017 of Apex Court in CIVIL APPEAL NOS. 17869-17870/2017 may be referred. Further, for the qualification acquired from IME, Mumbai, It was decided that the departments concerned be intimiated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Clarification regarding counting of AMICE equivalent to Recognized Degree for promotion in State Government. It was decided that the departments concerned be intimiated that in pursuance of CS Notification No. 42/158/2016-5GSI dated 19.01.2018 reiterating the directions issued vide the earlier CS Notification No. 42/178/2008-5GSI dated 21.05.2009, the department does not recognize the degree qualifications obtained by the candidates in distance mode education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It was also decided that the meeting of Equivalency committee be convened after every 3 (three) months.

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the Chair and all present in the meeting.